

**Contents**

| Abbreviations | vii |

**CHAPTER 1**

**Introduction: The role of European citizenship in the constitutionalisation of the European Union**

| 1.1 | Context of the research | 3 |
| 1.2 | Research question | 4 |

**CHAPTER 2**

**Analytical framework and structure**

| 2.1 | Introduction to the analytical framework | 11 |
| 2.1.1 | Context of research and main research question | 11 |
| 2.1.2 | Structure of the present chapter | 11 |
| 2.1.3 | Historical background and development of European citizenship in the Union | 12 |
| 2.1.4 | European citizenship: a constitutional concept or market citizenship? | 15 |
| 2.1.5 | Constitutionalisation and constitutionalism: What's in a name? | 18 |
| 2.1.6 | Constitutions | 19 |
| 2.1.7 | The rule of law in relation to constitutionalism | 20 |
| 2.2 | The constitutionalisation of the Treaties of the European Union | 21 |
| 2.2.1 | Constitutional developments in Community and Union law | 21 |
| 2.2.2 | Arguments against the constitutional nature of the European Union | 23 |
| 2.2.2.1 | The no-demos thesis | 24 |
| 2.2.2.2 | Citizenship, identity and alliance | 26 |
| 2.2.2.3 | Just an international organisation? | 27 |
| 2.3 | Constitutionalisation of the European Union in this thesis | 28 |
| 2.3.1 | Multi-level and composite constitutionalism in the European context | 29 |
| 2.4 | Structure, analytical framework and methodology of the thesis | 31 |
| 2.4.1 | Constitutionalisation in four constitutional elements | 31 |
| 2.4.1.1 | The division of powers | 32 |
| 2.4.1.2 | Common ideology | 33 |
| 2.4.1.2.1 | Fundamental rights | 33 |
| 2.4.1.2.2 | Democracy | 35 |
| 2.4.1.3 | Justiciability and hierarchy of norms | 37 |
| 2.4.1.3.1 | Judicial review in connection with European constitutionalisation | 38 |
| 2.4.1.3.2 | Constitutional primacy of Union law as constitutional element | 39 |
| 2.4.2 | Methodology and structure of the thesis | 40 |
CHAPTER 3

The effect of European citizenship on the vertical division of powers

3.1 Introduction: The division of powers and European citizenship

3.1.1 The vertical division of powers as constitutional feature

3.1.2 Aim and structure of the present chapter

3.2 The competences of the European Union and the scope of Union law

3.2.1 The principles of conferral, subsidiarity, proportionality and pre-emption

3.2.2 Complementary and negative competences

3.2.3 Beyond legislative competences of the Union

3.3 The scope of application of EU law in relation to the vertical division of competences

3.3.1 The relation between the competences and the scope of Union law

3.3.2 The scope of application of Union law

3.3.3 The scope of application of EU law in the case law of the Court on general principles of Union law

3.3.4 The scope of Union law with regard to the Charter of Fundamental Rights

3.3.5 Different legal consequences of ‘the scope’ and the ‘competences’ of the Union

3.4 How does European citizenship affect the vertical division of powers?

3.4.1 The scope and nature of Article 18 TFEU

3.4.1.1 Early case law on Article 18 TFEU

3.4.1.2 A citizenship interpretation of Article 18 TFEU

3.4.1.3 Personal scope of Article 18 TFEU

3.4.1.4 Migration as a precondition for the ratione personae?

3.4.1.5 ‘Lawful’ residence and the scope of Union law

3.4.2 The trigger of the material scope of Union law by European citizenship

3.4.3 Towards a restriction approach in citizenship cases

3.4.4 Indirect substantive rights for third-country nationals

3.4.5 Article 20 TFEU as a new route into the ‘Promised Land’

3.4.6 The influence of Union citizenship on the application of economic freedoms

3.5 A spill-over effect: From negative to positive integration

3.6 Conclusion: How does Union citizenship affect the vertical division of powers in the European Union?
## CH 4  
The effect of European citizenship on common ideology:  
the protection of fundamental rights linked to European citizenship

### 4.1 Introduction: fundamental rights and European citizenship  
101
### 4.1.1 Constitutionalisation and fundamental rights  
101
### 4.1.2 Universality of fundamental rights and European citizenship  
102
### 4.1.3 Aim and structure of the present chapter  
103
### 4.2 Equality linked to European citizenship  
105
#### 4.2.1 Equal treatment as a key element of citizenship  
105
### 4.2.2 Equality in different sources of law  
105
### 4.2.3 Equal treatment and European citizenship  
107
#### 4.2.3.1 Court-driven equality  
109
#### 4.2.3.2 Equal treatment and reverse discrimination  
111
### 4.3 Linking European citizenship and fundamental civil rights  
115
#### 4.3.1 What are civil rights?  
115
#### 4.3.2 Civil rights and Union citizenship  
116
##### 4.3.2.1 The right to move within the European Union  
118
##### 4.3.2.2 The right to reside in the European Union  
119
##### 4.3.2.3 The right to family life and family reunification and European citizenship  
122
##### 4.3.2.4 European citizenship and the application of the Charter  
125
##### 4.3.2.5 Protective civil rights  
127
##### 4.3.2.5.1 Security and safety as rights for Union citizens in the Area of Freedom, Security and Justice  
128
##### 4.3.2.5.2 An Area of Freedom, Security and Justice ‘offered’ to Union citizens: concrete rights?  
131
##### 4.3.2.5.3 Where European citizenship and the AFSJ come together: tensions and challenges  
133
#### 4.3.3 Safety and security in third countries: Diplomatic protection of Union citizens  
141
### 4.4 Social rights linked to European citizenship  
143
#### 4.4.1 European citizenship and social rights  
144
##### 4.4.1.1 The broader European socio-economic context  
145
##### 4.4.2 Social rights for Union citizens based on free movement and equal treatment  
146
##### 4.4.2.1 Solidarity and reasonable burden  
148
##### 4.4.2.2 ‘Real link’ as a tool to balance solidarity between migrants and nationals  
149
#### 4.4.3 Social rights for non-migrants: services of general economic interest  
154
### 4.5 Conclusion: European citizenship linked to fundamental rights protection in the European Union  
159
CHAPTER 5  
The effect of European citizenship on the common ideology in the European Union: democracy and political rights

5.1 Introduction: citizenship, political rights and democracy in the European Union 167

5.1.1 Aim and structure of the present chapter 167

5.2 Political rights and democracy as part of the common constitutional ideology 168

5.2.1 Political participation as part of citizens’ rights 168

5.2.2 Democracy as part of the constitutional common ideology of the European Union 169

5.2.3 Connection between political rights and democracy 170

5.3 Democracy in the European Union 171

5.3.1 Criticism of democracy in the European Union 171

5.3.1.1 The relationship between democracy, legitimacy and accountability 171

5.3.1.2 The democratic deficit: criticism of the Union’s model of democracy 172

5.3.1.3 Views on European democracy from a national constitutional perspective 173

5.3.1.4 No demos, no democracy? 175

5.3.2 Specific political rights for European citizens 176

5.4 The connection between European citizenship, democracy and political rights 177

5.4.1 Electoral rights regarding the European Parliament 177

5.4.1.1 On the personal scope of electoral rights regarding the European Parliament 178

5.4.2 Electoral rights regarding the national elections of Member States 182

5.4.3 Electoral rights regarding municipal elections 186

5.4.4 The right to submit complaints to the European Ombudsman 190

5.4.5 The right to petition to the European Parliament 194

5.4.6 The citizens’ initiative 195

5.4.7 Good governance and the role of civil society 198

5.5 Conclusion: the connection of European citizenship with democracy and political rights 201

CHAPTER 6  
The effect of European citizenship on the justiciability and constitutional primacy of Union law

6.1 European citizenship in the European judicial context 207

6.1.1 Constitutionalisation of the Union: primacy and justiciability of Union law 207

6.1.2 Aim and structure of the present chapter 208
6.2 Judicial review in the European landscape
6.2.1 Cooperation between courts: the Court of Justice and national courts in a multilevel context 209
6.2.2 Direct effect and primacy of Union law: obligations for national courts 209
6.2.3 The preliminary reference procedure as a cornerstone of judicial cooperation 211
6.2.4 Dialogues between the Court of Justice and national constitutional courts 214
6.3 European citizenship and justiciability in the European Union 216
6.3.1 Direct effect of Union citizenship provisions 216
6.3.2 Effects of direct effect of Articles 20 and 21(t) TFEU on justiciability 219
6.3.2.1 Illustration from national court practice: the effect of Ruiz Zambrano in Dutch case law 222
6.3.3 Shift in judicial review due to ‘personal circumstances test’ of citizens of the European Union 226
6.3.4 Constitutional impact of the ‘personalised’ proportionality test 232
6.4 The effect of European citizenship on the ‘constitutional primacy’ of Union law 236
6.4.1 Hierarchy and constitutional primacy within the European Union 236
6.4.2 The impact of European citizenship on the constitutional hierarchy of norms in the European Union 238
6.4.2.1 Tensions between primary Union law and secondary Union law 238
6.5 Conclusion: the impact of European citizenship on justiciability and constitutional primacy 243

CHAPTER 7

Conclusions: the effect of European citizenship on the constitutionalisation of the European Union
7.1 The concept of European citizenship in the constitutional context of the European Union 249
7.1.1 An open field... 249
7.1.2 European citizenship and constitutionalisation 250
7.1.3 Citizenship in a multi-layered European legal order 250
7.1.4 European citizenship: constitutional concept or market-based concept? 252
7.2 The contribution of European citizenship to the constitutionalisation of the European Union 255
7.2.1 Vertical division of powers 256
7.2.2 Fundamental rights protection 257
7.2.3 Democracy
7.2.4 Justiciability and constitutional primacy and European citizenship
7.3 European citizenship and constitutionalisation of the European Union combined
7.3.1 Fragmentation and constitutionalisation
7.4 European composite citizenship
7.5 Outlook: the future prospects of European citizenship in a constitutional context
7.5.1 Where we are in the open field
7.5.2 More destinations, new paths to explore?
7.5.2.1 Challenges...
7.5.2.2 ...and destinations ahead

Bibliography
Table of cases
Abbreviations
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Journal Abbreviation</th>
<th>Full Journal Name</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AJIL</td>
<td>American Journal of International Law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CJCEL</td>
<td>Columbia Journal for European Constitutional Law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CJEL</td>
<td>Colombian Journal of European Law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CML Rev.</td>
<td>Common Market Law Review</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CRISPP</td>
<td>Critical Review of International Social and Political Philosophy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ECL Rev.</td>
<td>European Constitutional Law Review</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EJLS</td>
<td>European Journal of Legal Studies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ELJ</td>
<td>European Law Journal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EJML</td>
<td>European Journal of Migration and Law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EL Rev.</td>
<td>European Law Review</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EPL</td>
<td>European Public Law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ER</td>
<td>Europa Recht</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FL Rev.</td>
<td>Fordham Law Review</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HILJ</td>
<td>Harvard International Law Journal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HLR</td>
<td>Hanse Law Review</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IJCL</td>
<td>International Journal of Constitutional Law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JCMS</td>
<td>Journal of Common Market Studies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JEPP</td>
<td>Journal of European Public Policy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JSP</td>
<td>Journal of Social Philosophy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LCP</td>
<td>Law and Contemporary Problems</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIEI</td>
<td>Legal Issues of Economic Integration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MJECL</td>
<td>Maastricht Journal of European and Comparative Law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MLR</td>
<td>The Modern Law Review</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NTER</td>
<td>Nederlands Tijdschrift voor Europees recht</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OJLS</td>
<td>Oxford Journal of Legal Studies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>REALaw</td>
<td>Review of European Administrative Law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SEW</td>
<td>SEW Tijdschrift voor Europees en Economisch Recht</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TDS</td>
<td>Teoria del Diritto e dello Stato</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UJIIEL</td>
<td>Utrecht Journal of International and European Law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>YEL</td>
<td>Yearbook of European Law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>YLJ</td>
<td>Yale Law Journal</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>